

Friends of Penzance Harbour

www.friendsofpzharbour.org

How to help STOP Option A!

This is a new version of "How to help" that takes account of the recent decision by Cornwall Council to resubmit its application for Listed Building Consent (LBC) in respect of the historic South Pier. Without LBC Option A cannot proceed. The previous application was turned down by the Strategic Planning Committee on 14th December 2009. The new application is identical in all respects, and there has been no significant material change in the circumstances surrounding the application.

Cornwall Council is now ignoring all alternatives and insisting that Option A is the only option for Penzance. This is not the case. Viable alternatives exist but have been ruled out by Cornwall Council on grounds that do not take the best interests of Penzance into account. And talk of taking the link to Falmouth is designed to intimidate residents into accepting a scheme that is not in the town's best interest. The extra distance and associated operational costs mean that a sustainable "lifeline" link to the Scillies cannot operate from Falmouth. The Council's own consultants told them this in 2004.

To help stop Option A and prepare the way for alternative arrangements in Penzance please consider the following actions:

If you have limited time please start at the top of the list and work down

1. Join our mailing list

This is the best way of keeping informed of developments. We will let you know when there are major developments and when your help is needed. Please go to:

www.friendsofpzharbour.org/join_mailinglist.php

2. Object to the re-submitted application for Listed Building Consent

See Annex I (below) for details of how to do this and points that you can include in your letter of objection. The deadline is March 4th 2010. If you have already done this, then please write again supplementing the points you previously made with a complaint about the process, and in particular the Council's resubmission of an identical application with no change in circumstances. Under the old Penwith District Council rules this wouldn't have been possible. This letter should be copied to members of the Strategic Planning Committee (contact details at Annex II below) and the Leader of Cornwall Council (contact details at Annex IV below). Cornwall Council has written to objectors suggesting that they do not need to object again but we strongly recommend you do.

3. Recruit an objector

We know that there are many more objectors out there than wrote letters of objection to the previous application for LBC. If each of you recruit another objector and encourage and help them to write a letter of objection we can easily take the total number of objections to over 1000. This is important as the supporters of Option A will be trying hard to turn their petition into letters of support.

4. Lobby in support of an upgrade to the listing of the South Pier

The South Pier is being assessed to raise its listing from Grade II to Grade II*. This would place it amongst the top 7% of historic buildings in the country and help to stop Option A.

Please write to the Rt Hon Ben Bradshaw MP, Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport, who will make the final decision. He can be contacted at: Department for Culture Media and Sport, 2-4 Cockspur Street, London, SW1Y 5DH or by e-mail to enquiries@culture.gov.uk (put "To Ben Bradshaw" in the "Subject" box).

5. Lobby national government to reject LBC

If the members of the Strategic Planning Committee give in to pressure from the Cabinet and support the request for LBC then the application will be passed to the Rt Hon John Denham MP, Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government for a final decision. He can be contacted at: Communities and Local Government, Eland House, Bressenden Place, London SW1E 5DU or by e-mail at contactus@communities.gov.uk (put "To John Denham" in the "Subject" box.). If you haven't already contacted them a copy of this letter could also be sent to English Heritage who will advise the Secretary of State. This should be sent to: Andrew Vines, English Heritage, 29 Queen Square, Bristol, BS1 4ND or by e-mail to andrew.vines@english-heritage.org.uk.

6. Remind your Cornwall councillor that you still object to Option A.

Their contact details can be found at Annex III (below).

7. Write to a celebrity!

If you know one that's brilliant. It you don't just write to your favourite. A celebrity endorsement at this stage would help enormously.

8. Pledge financial support for possible legal work

If all else fails we will challenge the legality of any decision to build on Battery Rocks beach. To do this we will need £50,000 or more for legal expenses. Many of you have already pledged support totalling several thousand pounds, and we thank you for that, but we are still a long way from what we will need. If you haven't made a pledge yet then please think about doing so (go to: www.friendsofpzharbour.org/pledge_support.php). If you think you might be one of the small number of people who are willing and able to provide very substantial support please call John Maggs on 01736 332741.

9. Put a poster in your window

These are downloadable from the web site; alternatively contact us and we will send you one.

10. Write to your MP

If you are in the St Ives constituency then you should write to Andrew George at 18 Mennaye Road, Penzance, Cornwall, TR18 4NG or fax: 01736 332866. He needs to know you continue to object to Option A.

11. Write to the *Cornishman* and *Western Morning News*

To help keep the issue in the public eye think about writing a letter expressing your concerns to the *Cornishman*, *Western Morning News* or other local media. Letters to *The Cornishman* and *WMN* should be sent to: letters@cornishman.co.uk and wmnletters@westernmorningnews.co.uk respectively.

12. Tell your friends

Word of mouth is vitally important to ensure that as many people as possible know about what is happening. The more that know the more that will object and the more difficult it is for Cornwall County Council, the Route Partnership and others to ignore us.

Annex I

How to Object to the re-submitted application for LBC

As a result of the recently enacted Harbour Revision Order (HRO) Cornwall Council now consider that they have permitted development rights for most of the Option A scheme to build on Battery Rocks beach (see www.friendsofpzharbour.org/blog_more.php?b=49 for more information)

The only thing standing between them and implementation of the Option A scheme is the need for "listed building consent" (LBC). A first application for LBC was rejected by the Council's Strategic Planning Committee on 14th December 2009.

An identical application has now been resubmitted (ref: 10-0095-LBC). A notice for it will appear in *The Cornishman* on 11th February and the deadline for objections will be 4th March.

The LBC application can be viewed at www.cornwall.gov.uk/default.aspx?page=21669. For more information about the importance of the listed South Pier view the application's Historic Building Analysis www.friendsofpzharbour.org/pdfs/HistoricBuildingAnalysis.pdf.

Any member of the public can object and this can be done either in writing to:

Phil Mason, Planning & Regeneration
Cornwall Council, St Clare, Penzance, TR18 3QW
Email: planning.west1@cornwall.gov.uk

Or on-line at: www.cornwall.gov.uk/default.aspx?page=14945. The on-line form asks you for an "application site address": just put "Penzance Harbour".

However you object be sure to quote the planning application no: **10-0095-LBC.**

All or some of the following points should be included in your objection but it will be most effective if it is written in your own words.

Key objections to planning application No. 10-0095-LBC "Listed Building Consent"

1. The works will seriously harm what the applicant's own Historic Building Analysis describes as "among the most sensitive of any archaeological sites in any Cornish urban environment, and, in a national context, as significant an archaeological resource as any harbour or coastal town in the country".
2. The demolition works will cause very substantial damage to the fabric of the listed building and in particular the pier's 1745 parapet wall. English Heritage has said that "the stonework to the South Pier is a distinctive part of the harbour and creates the setting for the entire area. The loss or concealment of part or all of the harbour walls as part of a scheme may be considered to have a large adverse effect on the heritage asset as a whole."
3. The works will irreversibly bury (through infill and rock armouring) large parts - including the oldest parts - of the largest, longest 18th century pier in Cornwall, fundamentally changing its character from a free-standing and iconic part of the town's historic landscape into little more than an underground and inaccessible archaeological relic. The applicant's own historic building analysis describes it as "part of an extensive and important harbour complex that puts it on a par with [Grade] II* [listed] harbour structures elsewhere in Devon and Cornwall", and goes on to say that the current Grade

II assessment is inaccurate and the pier should be Grade II* or "scheduled" which would make it part of the most important 8% of listed buildings in the whole country.

4. The works will fundamentally harm the character of the listed building by removing from view the elvan Portzoden reef on which the pier was built and which provided the original shelter from storms that led to the settlement that became Penzance; by removing the reef from view a key narrative linking the pier to its locality and to the history of the settlement of Penzance is lost.
5. The works will fundamentally alter the public's visual experience of the listed building and in particular the part it plays in views of Penzance from the sea, where the pier's part in the history of Penzance is at its clearest and the visible impact of the works is at their greatest.
6. The works involve the addition of a new pier head light, and the switching off of the historic 1853 lighthouse will eliminate the utility and seriously harm the character of a key element of the listed building. The light's new position relative to the pier head (some 20m away) will also seriously undermine the integrity and continuity of the listed building.
7. The abutment and tying-in of a massive modern concrete structure (and rock armour) to an historic building built to different tolerances will inevitably have serious negative impacts on the listed building's fabric and future stability.
8. By drawing heavy goods traffic further into the harbour area (at present they set down at the North Arm) the works will have an adverse impact on the setting and fabric of the listed building.
9. The materials and methods envisaged in the works are entirely out of keeping with the appearance and design of the listed building.
10. The nature of the works and the impact on the listed building is such that meaningful mitigation is not possible; the applicants own planning and heritage statement accepts as much when it describes mitigation in terms of "building recording".

Cornwall Council will almost certainly claim that the damage to the listed building is acceptable because the scheme carries "substantial benefits for the community", so it is important that in addition to items 1-10 (above) you also include the points made in items eleven and twelve (below):

11. The works will not enhance the environment (quite the contrary) and the placing of an industrial development and associated heavy goods vehicles in a leisure area of high historic and amenity values will hinder, not help, the economic regeneration of the area.
12. Because there are alternative plans that meet the same objectives without causing harm to the listed building also means that the works carry no special wider "substantial benefits for the community" of Penzance or the Isles of Scilly.

General objections to the scheme as a whole

1. The development is in conflict with a number of policies and objectives contained in the Local Plan and County Structure Plan.
2. The development will damage the listed South Pier and have a serious adverse effect on the setting and character of the historic harbour and of Penzance as a whole.
3. The development will obliterate Battery Rocks beach and seriously harm the landscape, amenity and natural values of the area.

4. The development ignores traffic congestion problems in the harbour area and does nothing to reduce the adverse effects of this on health, the natural and built environment and public safety.
5. The development's form, bulk and general design are not in keeping with the character of its surroundings.
6. By damaging the natural environment and undermining the town's most important heritage assets, the development harms features that are essential to the long-term wellbeing of the tourism industry and local economy.
7. Alternatives, and in particular the out-of-town freight depot proposal, would meet all the developer's objectives, make efficient use of existing sites and buildings, and remove over 250 cars, vans and lorries from the congested harbour area for each freight sailing.

Annex II

Contact details for the Members/Substitutes of the Strategic Planning Committee

Members

Stithians

Neil Plummer (Chairman)
An Velyn Seaureaugh, Seaureaugh
Stithians, Cornwall, TR3 7DL
Phone: 01209 860410
Email: nplummer@cornwall.gov.uk

Tintagel

Glenton Brown
Trethevy Farmhouse, Trethevy
Tintagel, Cornwall, PL34 0BE
Phone: 01840 770302
Email: gbrown@cornwall.gov.uk

St Enoder

Dick Cole
Lanhainsworth, Fraddon Hill, Fraddon
St Columb, Cornwall, TR9 6PQ
Phone: 01726 861869 ; 07791 876607
Email: ricole@cornwall.gov.uk

Kelly Bray

Jim Flashman
West Prince Farm, Sevenstones
Callington, Cornwall, PL17 8HZ
Phone: 01579 350893; 07976 253692
Email: jflashman@cornwall.gov.uk

Constantine

Neil Hatton
Mill Cottage, Polwheveral, Constantine
Falmouth, Cornwall, TR11 5RW
Phone: 01326 340677
neilhatton@constantinecornwall.co.uk

Penzance East

Ruth Lewarne
12 Roscadghill Parc, Penzance
Cornwall, TR18 3QX
Phone: 01736 361343
Email: rlewarne@cornwall.gov.uk

Penryn West

Mary May
Treluswell-Vean, Lower Treluswell
Penryn, Cornwall, TR10 9AT
Phone: 01326 377390; 07815 597994
[no email]

Truro Trehaverne

Fiona Ferguson (Vice Chairman)
Weir Meadows, Restronguet Weir, Mylor
Falmouth, Cornwall, TR11 5SS
Phone: 01326 375969; 07731 548139
Email: fiferguson@cornwall.gov.uk

Bugle

Jackie Bull
4 Chandlers Walk, Charlestown Road
St Austell, Cornwall, PL25 3NB
Phone: 01726 74619; 07800 732558
Email: jbull@cornwall.gov.uk

Mount Hawke & Portreath

Joyce Duffin
The Haven, Penberthy Road, Portreath
Cornwall, TR16 4LP
Phone: 01209 842713
Email: jmduffin@cornwall.gov.uk

St Just in Penwith

Chris Goninan
11 South Place, St Just,
Penzance, Cornwall, TR19 7HW
01736 788722
Email: cgoninan@cornwall.gov.uk

Camborne North

Bill Jenkin
Highfield House, Treswithian Downs
Camborne, Cornwall, TR14 0BY
Phone: 01209 710617 ; 07709 256400
Email: bjenkin@cornwall.gov.uk

Wadebridge West

Scott Mann
3 Bethan Drive, Wadebridge
Cornwall, PL27 7RW
Phone: 01208 815561
Email: smann@cornwall.gov.uk

Threemilestone

Chris Pascoe
Willow Green Farm, Threemilestone
Truro, Cornwall, TR4 9AL
Phone: 01872 277936 ; 07971 573766
Email: chpascoe@cornwall.gov.uk

Bude South

Nigel Pearce

5 Petherick Road, Bude
Cornwall, EX23 8SW
Phone: 01288 354580
Email: nigelpearce33@hotmail.com

Padstow

Stephen Rushworth

Higher Church Park, Clapper Farm
Egloshayle, Wadebridge, Cornwall,
PL27 6HZ
Mobile: 07966 473606
Email: srushworth@cornwall.gov.uk

St Ives South

Joan Symons

Lannanta Cottage, Trenoweth, Lelant
St Ives, Cornwall, TR26 3ET
Phone: 01736 798869 ; 07857 680924
Email: jhsymons@cornwall.gov.uk

Roche

John Wood

Chillbrook Farm, Tremodrett, Roche
St Austell, Cornwall, PL26 8LP
Phone: 01726 891393
[no e-mail]

Substitutes

Saltash Essa

Bob Austin

165 St Stephens Road, Saltash
Cornwall, PL12 4NJ
Phone: 01752 844666
Email: baustin@cornwall.gov.uk

Truro Moresk

Bert Biscoe

3 Lower Rosewin Row
Truro, Kernow, TR1 1EN
Phone: 01872 242293
Email: bertbiscoe@btinternet.com

Camborne South

Stuart Cullimore

14 Pendarves Street, Troon
Cornwall, TR14 9EG
Phone: 01209 719525
Email: scullimore@cornwall.gov.uk

Menheniot

Bernie Ellis

2 Pensipple Cottage, St Keyne
Liskeard, Cornwall, PL14 4SP
Phone: 01503 240463
Email: bellis2@cornwall.gov.uk

Pelynt

Richard Pugh

Trecan Farm, Lanreath
Looe, Cornwall, PL13 2PF
Phone: 01503 220768
Email: rpugh2@cornwall.gov.uk

Camborne Central

Jon Stoneman

12 Trevenson Street
Camborne, Cornwall, TR14 8JB
Phone: 01209 715109
Mobile: 07885 887371
Email: jstoneman@cornwall.gov.uk

Porthleven

Andrew Wallis

The Chip Inn, Fore Street, Porthleven
Cornwall, TR13 9HJ
Phone: 07817 742330 ; 07817 742330
Email: awallis@cornwall.gov.uk

Camborne West

David Biggs

Izar, Chapel Close, Kehelland
Camborne, Cornwall, TR14 0DB
Phone: 01209 713213
Email: dbiggs@cornwall.gov.uk

Wadebride East

Collin Brewer

Pencarrow Mill Cottage, Sladesbridge,
Wadebridge, Cornwall, PL27 6JF
Phone: 01208 841473
Email: cbrewer@cornwall.gov.uk

Chacewater

John Dyer

Penventinnie, Kenwyn
Truro, Cornwall, TR4 9EG
Phone: 01872 273329
Email: fjdye@cornwall.gov.uk

Falmouth

Steve Eva

34 Trescobeas Road, Falmouth
Cornwall, TR11 2JG
Phone: 01326 311539 ; 07974 812103
Email: seva@cornwall.gov.uk

Gulval & Heamoor

Mario Fonk

114 Roscadghill Parc, Heamoor
Penzance, Cornwall, TR18 3QY
Phone: 01736 332720
Email: mfonk@cornwall.gov.uk

Launceston South

Sasha Gilliard-Loft

Trenuth, Pipers Pool, Trewen
Launceston, Cornwall, PL15 8PH
Phone: 01566 880236 ; 07795 187518
Email: sgillardloft@cornwall.gov.uk

Newquay

Patrick Lambshead

30 Willow Close, Quintrell Downs
Newquay, Cornwall, TR8 4NG
Phone: 01637 851188
Email: plambshead@cornwall.gov.uk

St Buryan

Bill Maddern (Chairman)

10 Bodinnar Close, Newbridge,
Penzance, Cornwall, TR20 8NN
01736 364954
william.maddern@cornwall.gov.uk

Penryn East

Tony Martin

51 Lanyon Road, Playing Place
Truro, Cornwall, TR3 6HF
Phone: 01872 870683 ; 07766 341151
Email: tomartin@cornwall.gov.uk

Lostwithiel

Gavin Shakerley

Hall, Bodinnick, Fowey
Cornwall, PL23 1LX
Phone: 01726 870310
Email: gshakerley@cornwall.gov.uk

Carn Brea South

Kym Willoughby

23 West Trevingey, Redruth, Cornwall, TR15 3DJ.
Phone: 01209 219426
Email: kwilloughby@cornwall.gov.uk

Liskeard South

Mike George

11 Edgemoor Close, Lower Tremar
Liskeard, Cornwall, PL14 5EU
Phone: 01579 342559; 07974 650480
[no e-mail]

St Dennis

Fred Greenslade

Trevarno, 32 Wellington Road, St Dennis
St Austell, Cornwall, PL26 8BN
Phone: 01726 822789
Email: fred.greenslade@cornwall.gov.uk

St Keverne

Pam Lyne

Chywartha, Manaccan, Helston
Cornwall, TR12 6HU
Phone: 01326 231307
Email: plyne@cornwall.gov.uk

Lanivet

Mick Martin

Galorndon Core, Millpool, Bodmin
Cornwall, PL30 4HZ
Phone: 01208 821200
Email: mmartin@cornwall.gov.uk

Penwithick

Christopher Rowe

Sanfernando, 78 Treverbyn Road,
Carclaze, St Austell, Cornwall, PL25 4EW
Phone: 01726 75835 ; 07974 944683
Email: chrisrowe@sanfernando.fsnet.uk

St Ives North

Joan Tanner

Try Golowys, 4 Parc Bean
St Ives, Cornwall, TR26 1EA
Phone: 01736 795371
Email: jtanner@cornwall.gov.uk

Annex III

Contact details for Penzance Cornwall Council Members

Gulval & Heamoor

Mario Fonk

114 Roscadghill Parc, Heamoor,
Penzance, Cornwall, TR18 3QY
01736 332720

mfonk@cornwall.gov.uk

Marazion

Sue Nicholas

Brigstock, 8 Bampfylde Way
Perran Downs, Goldsithney
Penzance, Cornwall, TR20 9JJ
01736 711090

sunicholas@cornwall.gov.uk

Penzance Central

Tamsin Williams

Albert Cottage, Albert Terrace
Penzance, Cornwall, TR18 2DD
01736 363008

healingcornwall@aol.com

Penzance Promenade

Sue Pass

Tremhea Barn, Higher Tremenheere,
Ludgvan, Penzance, TR20 8XG
01736 364538

spass@cornwall.gov.uk

St Just in Penwith

Chris Goninan

11 South Place, St Just,
Penzance, Cornwall, TR19 7HW
01736 788722

cgoninan@cornwall.gov.uk

Ludgvan

Irene Bailey

Praise Cottage, 4 Higher Eglos Cottages,
Ludgvan, Penzance, Cornwall TR20 8HQ
01736 710278

Newlyn & Mousehole

Roger Harding

Trewoofe Farmhouse, Lamorna
Penzance, Cornwall, TR19 6PA
01736 810336, 01736 361998

sales@rcharlingandson.co.uk

Penzance East

Ruth Lewarne

12 Roscadghill Parc
Penzance, Cornwall, TR18 3QX
01736 361343

rlewarne@cornwall.gov.uk

St Buryan

Bill Maddern

10 Bodinnar Close, Newbridge,
Penzance, Cornwall, TR20 8NN
01736 364954

william.maddern@cornwall.gov.uk

You can find the names and addresses of all other Cornwall Council members at:

<http://democracy.cornwall.gov.uk/mgMemberIndex.aspx?bcr=1>

Annex IV

Contact details for Cornwall Council Cabinet Members

Leader of Cornwall Council

Alec Robertson
County Hall, Treyew Road
Truro, TR1 3AY
Tel: 01326 572650
arobertson@cornwall.gov.uk

Children Portfolio Holder

Sally Bain
Lawhyre Cottage, Rashleigh Lane
Fowey, Cornwall, PL23 1HP
01726 833766
sbain@cornwall.gov.uk

Health Portfolio Holder

Neil Burden
Trecarrell Manor, Trebulet
Launceston, Cornwall, PL15 9QG
01566 782286, 07717 378507
nburden@cornwall.gov.uk

Environment Portfolio Holder

Julian German
Trevinnick Meadow, Lanhoose
Gerrans, Truro, TR2 5EP
07528 983 379, 01872 322571
jgerman@cornwall.gov.uk

Communities Portfolio Holder

Lance Kennedy
53 Athelstan Park, Bodmin
Cornwall, PL31 1DT
01872 322571
lkennedy@cornwall.gov.uk

Transport & Planning Portfolio Holder

Graeme Hicks
County Hall, Treyew Road
Truro, TR1 3AY
01209 217605
ghicks@cornwall.gov.uk

Economics Portfolio Holder

Carolyn Rule
County Hall, Treyew Road
Truro, TR1 3AY
07751 685733
carorule@cornwall.gov.uk

Corporate Support Portfolio Holder

Jim Currie
Colley Weston, Penelewey
Feock, Truro, Cornwall, TR3 6QY
01872 865306, 01872 322571
jcurrie@cornwall.gov.uk

Housing Portfolio Holder

Mark Kaczmarek
Innsbruck, Penance Road
Lanner, Redruth, Cornwall, TR16 5TF
01209 211366, 01872 322571
mkaczmarek@cornwall.gov.uk

Adults Portfolio Holder

Armand Toms
36 Trenant Road, East Looe
Cornwall, PL13 1EP
01503 264823, 01872 322571
atoms@cornwall.gov.uk